Research Paper   Open Access

Women and Human Trafficking Issues

Rias Hanniati Pamesti Simanjuntak
Department of International Relations, National University, Indonesia

Abstract: Human trafficking continues to grow and is viewed as a threat to security. The question that arises is:what specific security threats are involved, and who are the actual targets of human trafficking carried out byorganized criminal groups? Conventional security approaches to human trafficking consider it a threat to nationalsecurity and border control. In contrast, feminist analysis focuses on protecting individual victims and identifyingthe perpetrators, noting that victims face threats not only from criminal groups but also from their own governments.This research argues that a feminist perspective is essential for understanding and addressing human traffickingcrimes. However, this does not mean that human security approaches should always be classified as feminist; rather,this paper aims to illustrate how feminist analysis emphasizes the importance of gender-based categorization. As isknown, feminism not only incorporates women into security frameworks and emphasizes human rights but alsocritically examines gender behaviors and stereotypes, which have historically led to women being positioned asvictims in gender-based violence practices.

Keywords: women; security; human trafficking; international relations; human exploitation

I.   Introduction

Feminist theories entered the field of international relations in the late 1980s and early 1990s (Bertone, 2000). The emergence of feminism in international relations was linked to significant upheavals within the discipline, often referred to as the "third debate" (or sometimes the "fourth debate"). Early feminist thinkers challenged the discipline of IR to reconsider how theories should be reformulated and how understandings of global politics should be developed when accounting for women's experiences. Feminists argue that only through gender analysis can the differing impacts of the global economic system on the lives of women and men be fully understood. Feminist scholars of international relations also critique some core concepts of IR, such as sovereignty, the state, and security.

In this study, the author demonstrates that a feminist approach offers two significant contributions to the analysis of international human trafficking. Firstly, it broadens the analytical focus beyond merely examining the exploitation of trafficked individuals, and secondly, it highlights how the social construction of human trafficking is shaped. The author argues that these feminist contributions can serve as a foundation for reformulating approaches to human trafficking within security studies.

This study examines how a feminist approach conceptualizes security issues and crimes against humanity, specifically human trafficking commonly perpetrated by organized criminal groups. Feminists analyze human trafficking and the status of prostitution in a more nuanced manner. The two perspectives within feminist discourse offer important insights for the future of human trafficking studies, highlighting the significance of focusing on the trafficked individuals while employing gender as an analytical category to better reflect the true circumstances of these individuals.

II.   Research Methods

This research used library research as a method of data collection. Library research was used because a large amount of data on organized crime and feminist thought can be found in informational books, scientific journals, newspapers, magazines, and websites accessible via the internet (Creswell, 2005). This technique aims to obtain data and information on the phenomenon of human trafficking carried out by organized crime groups.

Researcher conducted a comprehensive review of published articles and books on human trafficking, feminism, and organized crime. To begin this literature review, this research establishes several parameters for what is meant by an organized crime group, as defined by Hagan's thinking.

III.   Results and Discussion

Human Trafficking Terminology

The movement of women and children from one city to another and from one country to another for the purpose of employing them in criminal activities, holding them in legal or illegal brothels, or using them as slaves is a crime against humanity and a violation of civil rights. Undeniably, the trafficking of women and children for the purposes of slavery, child labor, pornography, and prostitution is a social problem that must be addressed. A social problem is a condition that has a significant impact on a large number of people and is preventable (Adepoju, 2005). Untold suffering and pain are intentionally created for women and children who are illegally transported and employed against their will.

Meanwhile, their families and loved ones assumed the victims had gone to work and would soon return. Then, they learned that their loved ones were living in torment and even death. Some families had to live without hearing from their loved ones. There were numerous reports of women and children being illegally transported from their homes for slavery, pornography, child labor, or even prostitution (Bales & Robbins, 2001). Some of these victims were trafficked and even murdered for their organs.

UN Protocol article 3 (a) defines trafficking in persons as follows (General Assembly Resolution, 2004):

"The recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat of use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation." Exploitation is defined as "the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labor or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs."

The Protocol does not define "exploitation of prostitution and other forms of sexual exploitation," as there was no consensus among government delegates to negotiate an agreed-upon meaning for the phrase. Government delegates at the Palermo Convention agreed that forced participation in prostitution could be considered organized trafficking, but almost all delegates rejected the idea that the unforced participation of adults constitutes organized trafficking. Therefore, states are free to define prostitution by adults without coercion based on their own laws and practices. The trafficking protocol focuses only on prostitution that is carried out under force and involves crimes such as violence, etc., and states should not consider the involvement of adults in prostitution to be part of trafficking (Bergeron, 2013).

Systematic studies of the criminal exploitation of women and children through trafficking by organized crime can be found in various research and reports. We often hear about missing children or missing adults. The question that then arises is, where are they? What happened to them? The answer is, they are often murdered for their organs, sold into slavery, forced into pornography, prostitution, or even used as sex slaves for the wealthy. Undoubtedly, the illegal movement of women and children often results in them being "declared missing." It is difficult to estimate the number of women and children trafficked each year by these organized crime networks (Bertone, 2000).

National and international crises can have an impact on the ease of the spread of illegal migration of women and children since the 1960s. From the Congo Crisis in the 1960s to the Nigeria-Biafra War (1967-1970), the Eritrean-Ethiopian War of the 1970s, the Mozambican War of Independence and the Marxist Regime crisis in the 1970s and 1980s, the Angolan war in the 1970s, 1980s, and 1990s, South Africa and the Apartheid Regime Crisis from the 1960s to 1994, the Liberian Civil War of the 1980s and 1990s, the Sierra Leonean Civil War of the 1990s, the Rwandan Genocide of the 1970s and 1980s, the Ethnic Cleansing in Uganda in the 1970s and 1980s, and the Nicaraguan crisis of the 1980s and 1990s, the Argentine Crisis of the 1970s and The 1980s, the Afghanistan-Soviet Union War of the 1970s and 1980s, Al Qaeda in Afghanistan, the Iraq-United States War that began in 2001, and the Palestine-Israel conflict from 1948 to the present, have seen more than 3 million women and children displaced illegally. However, the global impact of these illegal refugee movements has not been thoroughly studied. Civil wars and political crises create space for imperialism in developing countries. War makes women and children targets for greedy individuals seeking quick sources of income. Currently, almost all wars and crises occur in developing countries such as Africa, Asia, Latin America, and the Middle East. The consequence is that trafficking of women and children occurs from developing countries to industrialized, allied nations. Nearly all illegally displaced women and children from Africa, South America, the Middle East, and Asia end up in Western Europe,

Canada, and the United States. Since the collapse of the Soviet Union, the portrait of trafficking origin regions has become more extensive than ever. Although the characteristics of women who become victims of human trafficking vary, the driving factors are essentially the same across all regions (Doezema, 2000).

There are various studies on the characteristics of women who become victims of human trafficking by organized crime groups. Some studies describe them as victims. However, not all trafficked women are victims. Although studies on the trafficking of women and children remain fragmented, it is important for researchers to continue to capture diverse perspectives from trafficked victims, law enforcement agencies, NGOs, and human rights advocates, interviewing them to obtain comprehensive information about human trafficking.

IV.   Organized Crime Terminology

Unlike terrorist groups that pursue politics, religion, or ideology, transnational criminal groups pursue economics as their primary objective (Makarenko, 2004). The threat posed by this crime cannot be ignored, as extensive research shows that transnational organized crime threatens both global economic stability and global security (Eavis, 2001).

Phil Williams stated that the activities and networks of transnational criminal groups constitute the most serious non-military threat, potentially threatening the broader economy, including the economies of the United States, China, the European Union, and even developing countries that serve as markets for illegal goods (Raymond, 2001).

Looking at the volume of media coverage, Moran found that transnational organized crime increased significantly in the ten years between 1991 and 2001. 11 Globalization is considered a major contributor. Criminal groups of various organizational structures are involved in all types of crimes, including human trafficking and various commodities, financial crimes, torture, gambling, prostitution, and crimes involving violence (Moran, 2003).

Criminologist Frank Hagan's analysis can be used to establish a consensus on the meaning of organized crime. Hagan attempts to explain the common elements of organized crime. After reviewing numerous books explicitly defining organized crime, Hagan revealed that the definitions came from 13 authors and government reports on organized crime over a 15-year period. The research updated Hagan's analysis with authors attempting to define organized crime (Gushulak, 2000).

The good news is that a consensus is emerging regarding the underlying basis of organized crime. Hagan outlined 11 attributes inherent to organized crime: a hierarchical structure, a focus on profit margins, the use of coercion or threats, corruption with impunity, market monopoly, market demand, limited membership, a lack of ideology, niche markets, secret networks, and highly structured planning. Of these eleven attributes, the consensus is that organized crime functions as an extension of business, generating profits through illicit activities. Its continuity is ensured by the use of threats and pressure through corruption within the government to ensure immunity from law enforcement. There is also a consensus that organized crime tends to engage in the sale, purchase, and provision of illegal goods and services due to high public demand through monopolistic control and illicit markets (Hyland, 2001).

Hagan's attributes of organized crime illustrate the consensus that organized crime has an exclusive membership, has ideological or political motives behind its activities, requires specialization in planning or executing certain activities, or conducts its activities in secrecy. Therefore, the definition of organized crime, based on the consensus of authors over the past 35 years, is: organized crime is an extension of the criminal business that operates to generate profits through illicit activities due to high public demand. The continuity of activities is maintained through the use of force, threats, monopolistic control, and/or corruption of government agencies (Eavis, 2001).

V.   Feminism and Security Issues

Conventional scholars of international relations, particularly realists, define security primarily in terms of state security. A state's security is something that can protect its physical and moral boundaries against the anarchy of the international system. Neorealists focus on the anarchic structure of the international system, where there is no sovereign power to regulate state behavior. They view states as single actors whose internal structures and policies are less important than this anarchy in explaining their security and insecurity. Increasing power through states' military capabilities is a way to enhance their security; many security scholars believe that power is a means of promoting security and thus explains the behavior of states in the international context (Laczko, 2005).

In the 1980s, IR scholars began to challenge this explanation and attempted to articulate a broader definition of security. Since the 1945 war, IR scholarship has been saturated with ethnic and nationalist conflicts, and struggles

that do not transcend international borders, they have sought to analyze the relationship between military threats and economic and environmental threats (Madesn, 2009).

Nearly all of the world's poorest countries have military conflicts within their borders. These conflicts contribute to high levels of civilian involvement in structural violence, violence perpetrated against people when their basic needs are not met and when environmental damage occurs. Critical security scholars, as they call it, begin by defining the terminology of threats to human life and survival, the security of individuals and their environments, as well as the security of states.

Like critical security thinkers, many realist thinkers define security broadly, in a multidimensional and multilevel way, as the reduction of all forms of violence, including physical, structural, and ecological. According to feminists, security threats include domestic violence, rape, poverty, gender subordination, and environmental damage, as well as the threat of war. Feminists not only broaden the definition of security but also question who guarantees it. Almost all of their analyses of security begin from the bottom up, namely the individual or community, rather than the state or the international system.

VI.   Issues of Human Trafficking and Feminism

The meaning of security gained greater importance after the end of the Cold War, where security studies experts tried to expand the concept of security beyond the military to include issues such as economics, the environment, and health and to deepen the approach to security by adding levels of analysis. Feminist thinkers challenge traditional security approaches to international human trafficking on two levels: ethical and pragmatic. Feminists argue that, as an ethical issue, human trafficking is primarily a violation of human rights. The focus on trafficking as a security threat began to emerge at the end of the Cold War (Doezema, 2000).

Feminists have identified ethics and pragmatics to broaden the analytical focus from the state to society. Feminists have made the most significant contribution to explaining human trafficking, highlighting the destructive role that racist and gender stereotypes play in constructing categories of trafficking victims. A feminist approach to human trafficking is essential for security scholars who seek to position the activity as a threat to states and individuals. Feminists argue that traditional security approaches to human trafficking are inappropriate, not only morally but also pragmatically. The most significant feminist issue raises the question of who and what should be secured. If the object of security is the state, countertrafficking will focus on border control policies, thus treating trafficked individuals more as criminals than victims.

This situation not only threatens the human rights of trafficking victims but also exposes them to the possibility of re-trafficking if deported. If security coverage is expanded to include the safety of trafficked individuals, countertrafficking services, social services, and human rights protection, can be provided, thereby reducing victims' future vulnerability (Adepoju, 2005).

The feminist approach specifically emphasizes the need to stop prostitution, human trafficking, and sex trafficking and assumes that eliminating prostitution will end the need for sex trafficking and promote gender equality more effectively. The feminist approach focuses on several key elements of human trafficking. Trafficking victims are often initially deceived and deceived by recruitment strategies, their human rights are violated by those who traffic them, and their rights are also denied by the countries where they are placed. It is crucial for researchers, activists, and policymakers not only to protect and empower trafficking victims but also to consider the implications of how "trafficking victims" are forced into productive roles (Hyland, 2001).

Greater attention to the social construction of human trafficking, coupled with a focus on victims, is essential because the impact of gender stereotypes harms those who are victimized and marginalized. The impact on their lives must be analyzed in various ways, beyond simply viewing them as perpetrators and then exploiting them. Tickner cautions that "security concerns based solely on protecting and reinforcing gender hierarchies will only undermine the true security of women's lives." Analyzing issues related to human trafficking, explicitly feminists will explore how states can break this cycle (Laczko, 2005).

As pioneers of a human rights approach to human trafficking, feminist groups protest the widespread treatment of trafficked individuals, especially women, as criminals rather than victims (Raymond, 2001). Traffickers (traffickers) receive little punishment, while victims are victimized twice: first by the traffickers themselves and second by the governments they visit.

VII.   Conclusion

The process of human trafficking can be understood using a feminist perspective. This perspective supports the author's argument that human trafficking occurs due to several factors. These factors create unique dynamics in

its implementation on the ground, creating significant opportunities for women to become potential victims of human trafficking perpetrated by organized crime networks.

References

1. Adepoju, A. Review of research and data on human trafficking in sub-Saharan Africa. In : Data and Research on Human Trafficking: A Global Survey, ed. Frank Laczko and Elzvieta Gozdziak. IOM, Geneva, 2005, pp. 75-80
2. Bales K. and P.T. Robbins, No one shall be held in slavery or servitude: A critical analysis of international slavery agreements and concepts of slavery, Journal of International Affairs, 2001. 2 (2): 18-37.
3. Barry, Kathleen, Female Sexual Slavery (New York: New York University Press, 1979).
4. Bergeron, James. ‗ Transnational Organised Crime and International Security: A Primer', RUSI Journal (Vol, 158, No, 2, April/May 2013), pp. 6-9.
5. Bertone, A.M Sexual trafficking in women: International political economy and the politics of sex, Geneva Issues, 2000, 18(1): 4–18.
6. Creswell, Jhon W. Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitave, Quantitative and Mixed Methods Approaches, (London: Sage Publication, 2005), p. 27-28.
7. Doezema, J. Loose women or lost women? The re-emergence of white slavery in contemporary discourse of trafficking in women. Gender Issues, 2000, 18 (1): 23-55.
8. Eavis, Paul. ‗The Hidden Security Threat: Transnational Organised Criminal Activity', RUSI Journal (Vol. 146, No. 6, December 2001). Pp. 45-50
9. General Assembly Resolution 55/25 of 15 November 2000 dalam United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime and The Protocols Thereto, 2004.
10. Gushulak, B.D. and W.W. MacPherson, Health issues associated with the smuggling and trafficking of migrants, Journal of Immigrant Health, 2000, 2(2): 67–78.
11. Hyland, K.F . International Organization for Migration, Paths of Exploitation: Studies on the Trafficking of Women and Children Between Cambodia, Thailand, and Vietnam, IOM, Geneva. International Organization for Migration, New IOM figures on the global scale of trafficking, Traȧ cking in Migrant Quarterly Bulletin (April), 2001.
12. Laczko F. and E. Gozdziak, eds., Data and Research on Human Trafficking: A Global Survey, IOM, Geneva, 2005.
13. Madesn, Frank Transnational Organized Crime (Abingdon: Routledge, 2009).
14. Makarenko, Tamara ― The Crime-Terror Continuum: Tracing the Interplay between Transnational Organised Crime and Terrorism', Global Crime (Vol. 6, No. 1, Spring 2004), pp. 129-45.
15. Moran, N. R., The Globalization of Russian, Colombian, and Chinese Organized Crime 2001: A Time Series analysis. Dissertation Abstracts, 63 (7), 2003.
16. Raymond, G. Janice, and Donna M. Hughes, Sex Trafficking of Women in the United States: International and Domestic Trends (New York: Coalition Against Trafficking in Women, 2001).